

Rethinking Community Sanctions

Praise for *Rethinking Community Sanctions*

What do community sanctions look like in Australia in the 21st century? What can be done to realise their progressive potential and minimise their insidious effects? This lively, theoretically informed, empirically grounded book, written by a group of scholars with a deep knowledge of Australia's penal system, opens up new ways of thinking about a form of sanctioning that is widely used but little understood.

David Garland, New York University, USA

Drawing on the leading international literature on punishment, and further contributing to it, *Rethinking Community Sanctions* provides the first book-length study of community sanctions in Australia that is both comprehensive in scope and critical in nature. It redresses the profound imbalance between the critical attention devoted to the prison as a sanction and that directed at the far more common reliance on punishment and surveillance in the community, and it carefully elucidates the connections between the two. It does so with particular reference to those most vulnerable to being ensnared in the carceral dragnet. And it offers a positive alternative vision for the future of community sanctions. As much as academics should be drawn to this book, so too should lawyers, criminal justice practitioners and politicians who care about the current trajectory of the penal system.

Russell Hogg, Honorary Professor,
Centre for Crime, Law and Justice, Faculty of Law,
University of New South Wales, Australia

This brilliant book offers the first critical analysis of community sanctions in contemporary Australia – but its contribution goes much further than that. It is the first study anywhere to properly develop a decolonising perspective on this topic. Both by putting the present-day injustices in their proper historical context and by centering three populations who are too often marginalised in and by penal policy, practice and scholarship (indigenous people, women and people with mental health disorders and/or cognitive disabilities), this book represents a major advance in the study of probation and parole, but also in how we understand relationships between punishment, community and society more generally. Everyone who cares about those relationships should read it, digest it and use it.

Fergus McNeill, Professor of Criminology and Social Work,
University of Glasgow, UK

A compelling, comprehensive conceptual and empirical analysis of the social, political and legal nuances of community correctional practices in Australia, this book shows how the risk episteme underpinning community sanctions is limited and has differential effects on women, people with disabilities and racialised and Indigenous populations. The authors challenge us to reflect on the administrative and operational limits of these sanctions, binaries of community/custody, welfarist/risk and harsh/'soft' penalties. Readers are asked to scrutinise how technological, sociopolitical and populist rationalities reconfigure supervision, while simultaneously remaining hopeful about the potential of 'community' sanctions.

Kelly Hannah-Moffat, Centre of Criminology and Sociolegal Studies, University of Toronto, Canada

This page intentionally left blank

Rethinking Community Sanctions: Social Justice and Penal Control

BY

JULIE STUBBS

UNSW Sydney, Australia

SOPHIE RUSSELL

University of Technology Sydney, Australia

EILEEN BALDRY

UNSW Sydney, Australia

DAVID BROWN

UNSW Sydney, Australia

CHRIS CUNNEEN

University of Technology Sydney, Australia

And

MELANIE SCHWARTZ

UNSW Sydney, Australia



United Kingdom – North America – Japan – India – Malaysia – China

Emerald Publishing Limited
Howard House, Wagon Lane, Bingley BD16 1WA, UK

First edition 2023

Copyright © 2023 Julie Stubbs, Sophie Russell, Eileen Baldry, David Brown, Chris Cunneen and Melanie Schwartz.

Published under exclusive licence by Emerald Publishing Limited.

Reprints and permissions service

Contact: permissions@emeraldinsight.com

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, transmitted in any form or by any means electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise without either the prior written permission of the publisher or a licence permitting restricted copying issued in the UK by The Copyright Licensing Agency and in the USA by The Copyright Clearance Center. Any opinions expressed in the chapters are those of the authors. Whilst Emerald makes every effort to ensure the quality and accuracy of its content, Emerald makes no representation implied or otherwise, as to the chapters' suitability and application and disclaims any warranties, express or implied, to their use.

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN: 978-1-80117-641-5 (Print)

ISBN: 978-1-80117-640-8 (Online)

ISBN: 978-1-80117-642-2 (Epub)



ISOQAR
REGISTERED

Certificate Number 1985
ISO 14001

ISOQAR certified
Management System,
awarded to Emerald
for adherence to
Environmental
standard
ISO 14001:2004.



INVESTOR IN PEOPLE

Table of Contents

List of Figures and Tables	<i>ix</i>
List of Abbreviations	<i>xi</i>
About the Authors	<i>xv</i>
Acknowledgements	<i>xvii</i>
Chapter 1 Rethinking Community Sanctions	<i>1</i>
Chapter 2 Convergence and Divergence in Community Sanctions Policies	<i>25</i>
Chapter 3 Legal Processes and Community Sanctions	<i>51</i>
Chapter 4 Public Opinion, Signal Crimes and Narrowing ‘Experiential Distance’	<i>77</i>
Chapter 5 ‘Less Than More Likely Than Not’: Risk Mentalities, Technologies and Practices	<i>107</i>
Chapter 6 Whither Rehabilitation?	<i>131</i>
Chapter 7 Groups Vulnerable to Penal Control	<i>153</i>
Chapter 8 Politics and Democracy: Opening Up the Community Sanctions Landscape	<i>179</i>

viii *Table of Contents*

Cases and Legislation	195
Appendix: Uluru Statement From the Heart	197
References	199
Index	227

List of Figures and Tables

Figures

Chapter 1

- Figure 1.1. Rates of Community-Based Orders & Imprisonment, Australia 2001–2020 (March Quarter, per 100,000 Adults). 12
- Figure 1.2. Rates of Community-Based Orders & Imprisonment, Australian States & Territories, March 2020 (per 100,000 Adults). 14

Chapter 2

- Figure 2.1. Trends in Rates of Community-Based Orders, NT, NSW, Victoria and Australia, March 2002–2020 (per 100,000 Adults). 46
- Figure 2.2. Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander People Subject to Community-Based Orders, Australian States and Territories, March 2020 (Number). 48

Tables

Chapter 1

- Table 1.1. People Subject to Community-Based Orders or Imprisonment, Australian States and Territories (March 2020). 13

Chapter 2

- Table 2.1. Summary Characteristics of NT, NSW and Victoria. 45

Table 2.2.	Rates of Imprisonment and Community-Based Orders for Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander People, States and Territories, 2019–2020 (Age standardised rates).	47
------------	--	----

Chapter 3

Table 3.1.	Sanctions Administered by Corrective Services During 2019–2020.	53
Table 3.2.	People Serving Community-Based Orders by Type of Order, for States and Territories, March 2020 (Number).	54

List of Abbreviations

ABS	Australian Bureau of Statistics
ACCO	Aboriginal Community Controlled Organisation
ACT	Australian Capital Territory
AJA	Aboriginal Justice Agreements
ALRC	Australian Law Reform Commission
AOD	Alcohol and Other Drug
APB	Adult Parole Board (Victoria)
ARC	Assessment Referral Court
BOCSAR	Bureau of Crime Statistics and Research (NSW)
CBO	Community-Based Order (NT)
CBT	Cognitive Behavioural Therapy
CCO	Community Correction Order
CCS	Community Correctional Services (Victoria)
CCt.O	Community Custody Order (NT)
CCTO	Combined Custody and Treatment Order
CIA	Community Impact Assessment
CISP	Court Integrated Services Program
CJP	Community Justice Program
COMMIT	Compliance Management or Incarceration in the Territory
CREDIT	Court Referral of Eligible Defendants into Treatment
CRO	Conditional Release Order
CSNSW	Corrective Services NSW
CWO	Community Work Order
DRC	Royal Commission into Violence, Abuse, Neglect and Exploitation of People With Disability
EBP	Evidence-Based Policy and Practice

xii List of Abbreviations

EOMS	Extra Offender Management Services
EQUIPS	Explore, Question, Understand, Investigate, Practice, Plan and Succeed
ESO	Extended Supervision Order
GLM	Good Lives Model
HMIP	Her Majesty's Inspectorate of Probation
HOPE	Hawaii's Opportunity Probation With Enforcement
ICCO	Intensive Community Correction Order (NT)
ICO	Intensive Correction Order (NSW)
JR	Justice Reinvestment
LGA	Local Government Area
LSI-R	Level of Service Inventory – Revised
LSI-R:SV	Level of Service Inventory – Revised: Screening Version
MACNI	Multiple and Complex Needs Initiative
MERIT	Magistrates Early Referral into Treatment
MHD&CD	Mental Health Disorders and Cognitive Disabilities
NAAJA	North Australian Aboriginal Justice Agency
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisation
NOMS	National Offender Management Service
NPP	Non-parole Period
NSW	New South Wales
NSWLRC	New South Wales Law Reform Commission
NSWSPA	NSW State Parole Authority
NT LRC	NT Law Reform Committee
NT	The Northern Territory
OMF	Offender Management Framework
PACCOA	Probation and Community Corrections Officers' Association of Australia
PGI	Practice Guide for Intervention (NSW)
PSA	Post Sentence Authority (Victoria)
Qld	Queensland
RCADIC	Royal Commission into Aboriginal Deaths in Custody
RCPDCNT	Royal Commission into the Protection and Detention of Children in the Northern Territory
RNR	Risk-Need-Responsivity

SA	South Australia
SCAV	Sentencing Advisory Council Victoria
Tas	Tasmania
TJ	Therapeutic Jurisprudence
UK	United Kingdom
Vic	Victoria
VISAT	Victorian Initial Screening Assessment Tool
WA	Western Australia
WACC	Western Australia Community Corrections
WDO	Work and Development Order

This page intentionally left blank

About the Authors

Julie Stubbs was Professor and founding co-Director of the Centre for Crime, Law and Justice at the Faculty of Law and Justice, UNSW Sydney, where she is now an Honorary Professor. She was previously Professor and Director of the Institute of Criminology at the Faculty of Law, University of Sydney. She is a Fellow of the Academy of Social Sciences in Australia. Her research interests include women and criminal justice, legal responses to gendered violence, homicide, justice reinvestment and bail. Her books include: *Justice Reinvestment: Winding Back Imprisonment* (co-authored with Brown et al., 2016); *Australian Violence: Crime, Criminal Justice and Beyond* (co-edited with Tomsen, 2016); *Gender, Race and International Relations: Violence against Filipino Women in Australia* (co-authored with Cunneen, 1997) and *Women, Male Violence and the Law* (edited, 1994).

Sophie Russell is undertaking doctoral research at the University of Technology Sydney. She has undertaken research, policy and advocacy in community sector agencies and previously worked at the Institute of Criminology at the University of Sydney, and as Research Associate at the Faculty of Law and Justice, UNSW Sydney, and at Jumbunna Institute for Indigenous Education and Research at the University of Technology Sydney UTS. She is a volunteer with a community sector organisation that supports people on release from prison. Her recent publications include 'Rehabilitation and Beyond in Settler Colonial Australia: Current and Future Directions in Policy and Practice' (Russell, Beaufile, & Cunneen, 2022, in Vanstone & Priestley (Eds.), *The Palgrave Handbook of Global Rehabilitation in Criminal Justice*, pp. 33–52) and *Youth Justice and Penalty in Comparative Context* (with Goldson et al., 2021).

Eileen Baldry AO FASSA FRSN is Professor of Criminology at UNSW Sydney. She was appointed the first female Deputy Vice-Chancellor at UNSW in 2017. Professor Baldry taught Social Policy, Social Development and Criminology over the past 30 years. Her research and publications focus on social justice and include mental health and cognitive disability in the criminal legal systems; criminalised women, Indigenous women and youth; education, training and employment for prisoners; homelessness and transition from prison; community development and social housing; and disability services. Professor Baldry has been and is a Chief Investigator on numerous grants since 1993, contributes to Commissions and Inquiries and has published over 150 peer-reviewed books, articles and reports. In 2021 she was appointed an Officer of the Order of

Australia for ‘distinguished service to tertiary education, to criminology and social welfare policy, and as an advocate for diversity, equity and inclusion’.

David Brown is Emeritus Professor at the University of NSW, Sydney, where he taught Criminal Law, Criminal Justice, Crime Prevention, Community Corrections and Penology courses from 1974 to 2008. He is lead co-author of *Criminal Laws*, now in its 7th edition (2020), the leading student teaching text in criminal law in universities in NSW. He is widely published across the broad areas of criminal law, criminal justice, criminology and penology, both in Australia and internationally. His co-authored or co-edited books include: *Youth Justice and Penalty in Comparative Context* (with Goldson et al., 2021); *Justice Reinvestment: Winding Back Imprisonment* (Brown et al., 2016); *Penal Culture and Hyperincarceration* (with Cunneen et al., 2013); *The New Punitiveness* (with Pratt et al., 2005); *Prisoners as Citizens* (with Wilkie, 2002); *Rethinking Law and Order* (with Hogg, 1998) and *The Prison Struggle* (with Zdenkowski, 1982). He served as a Part-Time NSW Law Reform Commissioner on the Bail reference (2011–2012).

Chris Cunneen is Professor of Criminology at Jumbunna Institute for Indigenous Education and Research at the University of Technology Sydney. He also holds honorary professorial positions at UNSW Sydney and the Cairns Institute, James Cook University. He is a Fellow of the Academy of Social Sciences in Australia and a Fellow of the Australian and New Zealand Society of Criminology. He has particular interests in Indigenous legal issues and access to justice, racialisation and criminalisation, youth justice, justice reinvestment and penalty. His recent books include *Defund the Police. An International Insurrection* (2023), *Youth Justice and Penalty in Comparative Context*, (with Goldson et al., 2021), *Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Legal Relations* (with Behrendt et al., 2019) and *Indigenous Criminology* (with Tauri, 2016).

Melanie Schwartz is an Associate Professor and Deputy Dean (Education) at the Faculty of Law and Justice, UNSW Sydney. She teaches and researches in the areas of criminal justice and access to justice, with a particular interest in Indigenous justice issues. Her co-authored books include *Youth Justice and Penalty in Comparative Context* (with Goldson et al., 2021); *Criminal Laws* (with Brown et al., 2015, 2020); *Justice Reinvestment: Winding Back Imprisonment* (with Brown et al., 2016) and *Penal Culture and Hyperincarceration* (with Cunneen et al., 2013).

Acknowledgements

Working toward this book in the context of a global pandemic has entailed personal and professional challenges. It also has given added emphasis to concerns about care and support, connection to friends, family and communities, safety and wellbeing, matters that are salient to our analysis of community sanctions.

We are very appreciative of the contributions by the many organisations that facilitated interviews and provided data and documents, and by people who agreed to be interviewed for our research. Across all sectors, busy people made time for us; those who participated expressed a deep concern to improve outcomes for people subjected to community sanctions. We especially thank Corrections Victoria, the Koori Justice Unit and the Victorian Department of Justice and Regulation for approving our application to carry out research and for their assistance.

Our work benefited from excellent research assistance provided by Genevieve Wilks, Gabi Bloom, William Jackson, Jack McNally and Ayse Selcuk. Our workshop was organised and supported by Gabi Bloom along with Ryan Barratt, Hayley Barrington, Romy Gelber and Kate Lloyd. Thank you to all.

We also thank our respective universities and our colleagues in the Faculty of Law and Justice at UNSW, Sydney, and the Jumbunna Institute for Indigenous Education and Research at the University of Technology Sydney. We are fortunate to work within contexts and among colleagues that foster and support research directed toward social justice.

We gratefully acknowledge that this project was made possible by funding from the Australian Research Council (grant DP170100893) and workshop funding from the Faculty of Law and Justice, UNSW Sydney.

Julie Stubbs, Sophie Russell, Eileen Baldry,
David Brown, Chris Cunneen and Melanie Schwartz
Sydney, January 2023